Precursors to the Data Explosion: Teaching How to Compute with Data

Nicholas J. Horton

Amherst College, Amherst, MA, USA

October 7, 2013

nhorton@amherst.edu

► < Ξ > <</p>

Acknowledgements

- joint work with Ben Baumer (Smith College), Linda Loi (Smith College), Mine Çetinkaya-Rundel (Duke University) and Andrew Bray (University of Massachusetts/Amherst)
- supported by NSF grant 0920350 (building a community around modeling, statistics, computation and calculus)
- more information at http://www.mosaic-web.org

・ 同 ト ・ ヨ ト ・ ヨ

Prelude Reproducible analysis R Markdown

Prelude

Nolan and Temple Lang (TAS, 2010)

The nature of statistics is changing significantly with many opportunities to broaden the discipline and its impact on science and policy. To realize this potential, our curricula and educational culture must change. ... Computational literacy and programming are as fundamental to statistical practice and research as mathematics. ... We advocate that our field needs to define statistical computing more broadly to include advancements in modern computing, beyond traditional numerical algorithms.

Prelude Reproducible analysis R Markdown

Nolan and Temple Lang framework

- broaden statistical computing
- eepen computational reasoning and literacy
- O compute with data in the practice of statistics

• • • • • • • •

Introduction and Markdown

R Markdown and Intro Stats Outcomes Next steps **Prelude** Reproducible analysis R Markdown

Prelude

- "New Frontier in statistical thinking" (Chamandy, Google)
- teaching precursors to big data/foundations of data science as an intellectually coherent theme (Pruim, Calvin College)
- growing importance of computing and ability to "think with data" (Lambert, Google)
- acknowledgments of the challenges of developing "data habits of mind" (Finzer, TISE 2013)

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト

Prelude Reproducible analysis R Markdown

How to accomplish this?

- start in the first course
- build on this in the second course
- develop more opportunities for students to apply their knowledge in practice (internships, collaborative research, teaching assistants)
- new courses, capstones and co-curricular opportunities focused on "Data Science"

A (1) < A (1) < A (1) < A (1) </p>

Introduction and Markdown

R Markdown and Intro Stats Outcomes Next steps Prelude Reproducible analysis R Markdown

Plan for talk

- background on reproducible analysis
- introduction to R Markdown
- how to make it work in the introductory course
- outcomes and assessment
- what next?
- conclusions

・ 同 ト ・ ヨ ト ・ ヨ ト

Prelude Reproducible analysis R Markdown

Background on reproducible analysis

The purpose of Sweave is to create dynamic reports, which can be updated automatically if data or analysis change. Instead of inserting a prefabricated graph or table into the report, the master document contains the code necessary to obtain it. When run through a statistics package, all data analysis output (tables, graphs, . . .) is created on the fly and inserted into a final document. The report can be automatically updated if (when!) data or analysis change, which allows for truly reproducible research. (Leisch, R-News 2002)

(4月) (1日) (1日)

Prelude Reproducible analysis R Markdown

Reproducible analysis

- integrate code and documentation
- automate documentation and report generation
- helps to structure analysis for new users
- (particularly) useful to students to facilitate appropriate and correct statistical workflow
- helps minimize the pain of iterative analyses
- leaves behind a clear online trail

• • • • •

Introduction and Markdown

R Markdown and Intro Stats Outcomes Next steps Prelude Reproducible analysis R Markdown

Background

Rooted in Literate Programming

Let us change our traditional attitude to the construction of programs: Instead of imagining that our main task is to instruct a computer what to do, let us concentrate rather on explaining to humans what we want the computer to do. (Donald E. Knuth, 1984).

• • • • •

Introduction and Markdown

Markdown and Intro Stats Outcomes Next steps Prelude Reproducible analysis R Markdown

Background

Rooted in Literate Programming

Let us change our traditional attitude to the construction of programs: Instead of imagining that our main task is to instruct a computer what to do, let us concentrate rather on explaining to humans what we want the computer to do. (Donald E. Knuth, 1984).

Key idea: simplify the cognitive load by providing a structure and foundation for statistical analysis

A (1) < A (1) < A (1) < A (1) </p>

Prelude Reproducible analysis R Markdown

Reproducible statistical analysis (cont.)

- previous implementations (Sweave/knitr) required knowledge of markup language (such as LATEX)
- examples: case studies in R from the *Statistical Sleuth* at http://www.amherst.edu/~nhorton/sleuth
- disadvantage: extra degree of difficulty for new students
- much simpler interface using R Markdown

・ 同 ト ・ ヨ ト ・ ヨ ト

Prelude Reproducible analysis R Markdown

R Markdown

- allows easy authoring of reproducible web reports from R
- features a simple text format with embedded R chunks
- chunks similar to Sweave/knitr
- chunks are executed, saving output and graphics
- files are "woven" into plain markdown files
- these markdown files are compiled into HTML documents
- images are bundled into the HTML, for portability
- simplified interface within RStudio
- disadvantage: less control of output formatting

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト

Prelude Reproducible analysis R Markdown

Creating a Markdown file in RStudio

| 🕷 RStudio | File Edit Code View Plots | Session Build Tools Window Help | | | | | |
|---|---|---|--|--|--|--|--|
| 000 0- <u>-</u> - | New File New Project | R Script 企業N -/Dropbox/MTH241S13/pr | | | | | |
| Console ~/Droph | Open File ₩O Recent Files | Text File Rd File C/C++ File | | | | | |
| R version 3.0 Copyright (C) Platform: x86 | Open Project Open Project in New Window Recent Projects | R Sweave R Markdown R HTML | | | | | |
| R is free sof You are welco Type 'license | Save #S Save As Save All | R Presentation in conditions. on details. | | | | | |
| Natural lan | Print | nglish locale | | | | | |
| R is a collab Type 'contrib | Close 第W Close All 企業W | utors. | | | | | |
| 'citation()' | Close Project | publications. | | | | | |
| Type 'demo()' for some demos, 'help()' for on-line help, or 'help.start()' for an HTML browser interface to help. Type 'q()' to quit R. | | | | | | | |
| > | |) | | | | | |

Prelude Reproducible analysis R Markdown

Example

Title

This is an R Markdown document. Markdown is a simple formatting syntax for authoring web pages

When you click the **Knit HTML** button a web page will be generated that includes both content as well as the output of any embedded R code chunks within the document. You can embed an R code chunk like this:

```{r}
summary(cars)
````

・ロト ・ 同ト ・ ヨト ・ ヨト - -

```
Introduction and Markdown
                  R Markdown and Intro Stats
                               Outcomes
                                           R Markdown
                               Next steps
Editing a Markdown file
          RStudio
                                                            Build
                    File
                         Edit
                               Code
                                      View
                                             Plots
                                                   Session
                                                                    Tools
                                                                           Window
    000
                                                                         ~/Dropbox/M
    👰 🗸 🥣 🖌 🖳 🔝 🔚 🛛 🏕 Go to file/function
     Untitled1 ×
            🔲 🗳 🔍 💽 🗸 💰 Knit HTML
                                                                              🔫 Run
           Title
        1
        2 -
        3
        4
           This is an R Markdown document. Markdown is a simple formatting syntax
           authoring web pages (click the **Help** toolbar button for more detail
           Markdown).
        5
        6
           When you click the **Knit HTML** button a web page will be generated t
           both content as well as the output of any embedded R code chunks withi
           document. You can embed an R code chunk like this:
        7
        8
              {r}
           summary(cars)
        9
       10 -
```

Prelude Reproducible analysis R Markdown

Displaying the formatted results

Title

This is an R Markdown document. Markdown is a simple formatting syntax for authoring web pages (click the **Help** toolbar button for more details on using R Markdown).

When you click the **Knit HTML** button a web page will be generated that includes both content as well as the output of any embedded R code chunks within the document. You can embed an R code chunk like this:

summary(cars)

| ## | speed | dist | | |
|----|--------------|-------------|--|--|
| ## | Min. : 4.0 | Min. : 2 | | |
| ## | 1st Qu.:12.0 | 1st Qu.: 26 | | |
| ## | Median :15.0 | Median : 36 | | |
| ## | Mean :15.4 | Mean : 43 | | |
| ## | 3rd Qu.:19.0 | 3rd Qu.: 56 | | |
| ## | Max. :25.0 | Max. :120 | | |

You can also embed plots, for example:

plot(cars)

Prelude Reproducible analysis R Markdown

Additional features

```
RStudio: Preview HTML
example.Rmd ×
                                                         \neg \square
     ABC O MD
                  💰 Knit HTML
                                                                 Preview: ~/example.html
                                         Chunks -
      Header 1
  1
                                                                 Header 1
  2
  3
      This is an R Markdown document. Markdown is a
      simple formatting syntax for authoring web pages.
                                                                 This is an B Markdown document, Markdown
                                                                 simple formatting syntax for authoring web pa
  4
  5
     Use an asterisk mark, to provide emphasis such as
                                                                 Use an asterisk mark, to provide emphasis su
                                                                 as italics and bold
      *italics* and **bold**.
  6
                                                                 Create lists with a dash:
  7
     Create lists with a dash:

    Item 1

  8
      - Ttem 1

    Item 2

  9
      - Item 2

    Item 3

 10
      - Item 3
                                                                 You can write in-line code with a back-tick
 11
 12
      You can write `in-line` code with a back-tick.
                                                                  Code blocks display
 13
                                                                  with fixed-width font
      . . .
 14
 15
      Code blocks display
                                                                    Blockquotes are offset
 16
      with fixed-width font
 17
 18
 19
      > Blockauotes are offset
 20
```

Nicholas J. Horton Teaching How to Compute With Data

Motivation Implementation Homework Projects

Motivation

Some may (reasonably) argue:

The introductory statistics course syllabus is already jam-packed. Why include R Markdown in the Intro Course?

(1日) (1日) (1日)

Motivation Implementation Homework Projects

Increased importance of computing

Information technologies are increasingly important and should be added to the (statistics) curriculum, as should the ability to reason about computational resources, work with large datasets, and perform computationally intensive tasks (Nolan and Temple Lang, TAS 2010).

Motivation Implementation Homework Projects

ASA Curricular guidelines (circa 2000)

Computational - Working with data requires more than basic computing skills. Programs should require familiarity with a standard statistical software package and encourage study of data management and algorithmic problem-solving.

- Is this sufficient background for students heading out in a world awash with data?
- If not, then when should we start teaching these capacities?

Motivation Implementation Homework Projects

Alternatives?

- separate statistics package and layout package
- cut and paste in between
- huge potential for error
- discourages iteration
- separates computation from analysis

・ 同 ト ・ ヨ ト ・ ヨ

Motivation Implementation Homework Projects

Implementation

- early and often
- start simple
- homework
- projects

< ロ > (同 > (回 > (回 >))

э

Motivation Implementation Homework Projects

Prezi introduction for students

Nicholas J. Horton Teaching How to Compute With Data

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト

э

Motivation Implementation Homework Projects

Start early: first homework assignment

- template for homework solution provided to students
- provided commands to load data and create new variables, as needed
- early in the course, included most commands needed to run analyses, as a way of helping students to get up to speed
- main task: annotate and interpret the output
- used for all homeworks in the course

Motivation Implementation Homework Projects

Why projects? (carpentry metaphor due to McGowan)

In week 1 of the carpentry (statistics) course, we learned to use various kinds of planes (summary statistics). In week 2, we learned to use different kinds of saws (graphs). Then, we learned about using hammers (confidence intervals). Later, we learned about the characteristics of different types of wood (tests). By the end of the course, we had covered many aspects of carpentry (statistics). But I wanted to learn how to build a table (collect and analyze data to answer a question) and I never learned how to do that.

Motivation Implementation Homework Projects

Projects in Intro and Intermediate Stat

- projects an effective way to implement many of the GAISE recommendations (Halvorsen, ICOTS8 2010)
 - use real data
 - stress conceptual understanding rather than mere knowledge of procedures
 - use technology for ... analysing data
- generally done in groups of 3-4
- need for audit trail is key given iteration around coding and analyses
- many deliverables throughout the semester
- culminates in a final report

Motivation Implementation Homework Projects

Computing challenges for projects

- data cleaning and variable derivation
- summary statistics and univariate graphical display
- multiple regression model
- assessment of model using variety of diagnostics
- iterative process: many false starts
- students often get muddled as datasets change, coding is modified, and analyses proceed

A (1) < A (1) < A (1) < A (1) </p>

Motivation Implementation Homework Projects

Grading and feedback

- hardcopy (old school)
- separate feedback (uploaded to Moodle or other CMS)
- integrated comments (requires some knowledge of html)

(日) (同) (三) (三)

Motivation Implementation Homework Projects

Grading and feedback

Exercise 8:

The most total number of births in the U.S. was in 1961.

which.max((present\$boys + present\$girls))

[1] 22

3/3. Think about how to identify the maximum year by referencing the index that

э

Motivation Implementation Homework Projects

Grading and feedback

<code class="r">which.max((present\$boys + present\$girls))
</code>

<code>## [1] 22
</code>

<h6>3/3. Think about how to identify the maximum year by refer

</body>

</html>

< 日 > < 同 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ >

Courses studied Feedback Survey results

Results from Duke University

- n=221 students used R Markdown during the 2012–2013 academic year
- introductory statistics course
- students generally had no computational background
- completed team based project
- ۲

(1日) (1日) (1日)

Next steps

Courses studied Feedback Survey results

Results from Smith College

| Course | Fall 2012 | Spring 2013 | Fall 2013 |
|----------------------------|-----------|-------------|--------------|
| Intro Stats | 42 | 70 | \approx 40 |
| Regression Analysis | 33 | | |
| Data Science | | | pprox 25 |
| Total | 75 | 70 | pprox 65 |

Table : R Markdown exposure at Smith College. 11 of 20 pre-registered students for Data Science have already used R Markdown.

▲ □ ▶ ▲ □ ▶ ▲ □ ▶

Courses studied Feedback Survey results

Feedback

- n=70 students in spring Intro Stats completed surveys at the beginning and end of the semester (n=56 with data at both times)
- mid-semester assessment (qualitative) and end of semester evaluations
- summary: students got up to speed with R Markdown, but would have welcomed more introduction and structure for first exposure

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト

Courses studied Feedback Survey results

Sample survey items

R Markdown

Please indicate the response that most closely matches your attitude towards each of the follow statements.

1. I find the R Markdown syntax to be simple and understandable.

| | no opinion | strongly disagree | disagree | indifferent | agree | strongly | agr |
|----|---|----------------------|----------------|---------------|-------------|----------|-----|
| 2. | When my Mark | down document does i | not compile, I | know how to g | o about fix | ing it. | |
| | no opinion | strongly disagree | disagree | indifferent | agree | strongly | agr |
| 3. | 3. I am frequently frustrated by R Markdown when doing my homework. | | | | | | |
| | no opinion | strongly disagree | disagree | indifferent | agree | strongly | agr |

・ロト ・ 日 ・ ・ ヨ ・ ・ ヨ ・

э

Courses studied Feedback Survey results

Survey results

| | Initial | | Final | | Change | |
|----------|---------|-------|--------|-------|--------|-------|
| Question | Mean | SD | Mean | SD | Mean | SD |
| Q1 | -0.300 | 0.931 | 0.241 | 1.053 | 0.527 | 1.124 |
| Q2 | -0.527 | 1.069 | -0.045 | 1.054 | 0.482 | 1.424 |
| Q3 | -0.500 | 1.040 | -0.098 | 1.068 | 0.402 | 1.189 |
| Q4 | -0.682 | 0.899 | -0.205 | 1.167 | 0.455 | 1.263 |
| Q5 | 0.345 | 0.947 | 0.839 | 0.804 | 0.509 | 0.791 |
| Q6 | 0.725 | 0.940 | 0.873 | 1.055 | 0.100 | 0.995 |
| Q7 | 0.349 | 0.988 | 0.545 | 1.020 | 0.240 | 1.027 |
| Q8 | 0.223 | 0.825 | 0.830 | 0.752 | 0.607 | 0.943 |
| Q9 | 0.082 | 0.891 | 0.330 | 0.926 | 0.255 | 1.027 |
| Q10 | -0.045 | 1.001 | 0.300 | 1.003 | 0.345 | 0.990 |
| Q11 | -1.464 | 0.785 | -1.509 | 0.795 | -0.045 | 0.955 |

・ロト ・ 日 ・ ・ 日 ・ ・ 日 ・ ・

æ

Courses studied Feedback Survey results

Survey results (cont.)

- Q 5, 6, 7, 9, and 10 address R Markdown's role in the data analysis workflow: for all five questions, the students responses were favorable at the end of semester, and grew more favorable over the course of the semester
- Q 3, 4, and 8 address the issue of frustration with R and R Markdown.
- While initial frustration with both R and R Markdown was reasonably high, by the end of the semester it had largely dissipated
- Students grew to appreciate R Markdown's ability to streamline their homework workflow
- In particular, students did not prefer to copy-and-paste their work from R into Microsoft Word.

イロト イ得ト イヨト イヨト

Courses studied Feedback Survey results

Survey results (cont.)

- There was little to no correlation between a student's attitude towards R Markdown and that student's performance in the course
- Prior exposure to markup languages similar to R Markdown was not an impediment to learning R Markdown

▲ □ ▶ ▲ □ ▶ ▲ □ ▶

Other exposure to Markdown Data Science at Smith College Future work and closing thoughts

Upper level classes

- build on first exposure in second course, more substantive projects
- leverages existing experiences to move along further in the second course
- instructor can scaffold more complicated manipulations and analysis
- feasible to get AP stats students directly into second courses which demonstrate the excitement of statistics
- leads to capstone, internship or other culminating experience

(日) (同) (三) (三)

Other exposure to Markdown Data Science at Smith College Future work and closing thoughts

Other co-curricular opportunities

- utilize R Markdown or knitr in collaborative projects (a la St. Olaf Center for Interdisciplinary Reserach) or consulting work with students
- allows storage, reuse and auditing of student code
- program review (by another student)
- technical review: verification of each number in paper (by another student)
- helps develop a cadre of students with confidence and expertise to guide other students

Other exposure to Markdown Data Science at Smith College Future work and closing thoughts

Data Science at Smith College Fall 2013 (Baumer)

- provides a practical foundation for students to compute with data
- demonstrates the entire data analysis cycle (forming a statistical question, data acquisition, cleaning, transforming, modeling and interpretation)
- introduce students to tools for data management, storage and manipulation that are common in data science (e.g. R, SQL)
- undertake practical analyses using real, large, messy data sets using those tools
- learn to think statistically in approaching all of these aspects of data analysis
- minimal pre-requisites (intro stats plus intro CS)

Other exposure to Markdown Data Science at Smith College Future work and closing thoughts

Other possible approaches

- Data Science Ben Baumer (Smith College), Rachel Schutt's innovative book
- Data Mining Modern Methods of Data Analysis (STAT 425), Brant Deppa (Winona State)
 - Math Stat modified Moore method (empirical and analytic solutions)
- Advanced Data Analysis Cosma Shalizi and Rebecca Nugent (CMU)
 - CIR and similar models (summer research, year-long projects)

Other exposure to Markdown Data Science at Smith College Future work and closing thoughts

Closing thoughts

- Peck and Chance (2007): "When your students graduate, what is something observable that you think they ought to be able to do?"
- Nolan and Temple Lang (2010): "What ought our students be able to do computationally, and are we preparing them adequately in this regard?"
- Cobb argued (TISE, 2007) "Our courses teach techniques developed by pre-computer-era statisticians as a way to address their lack of computational power"
- we need a major cultural shift to embrace computing and fully integrate it into statistics programs, beginning at the undergraduate level

(日) (同) (三) (三)

Other exposure to Markdown Data Science at Smith College Future work and closing thoughts

More from Nolan and Temple Lang



Other exposure to Markdown Data Science at Smith College Future work and closing thoughts

More from Nolan and Temple Lang

In the spirit of Peck and Chance, we ask, What do our students do when they graduate? We have found that Bachelors and Masters students who enter the workforce spend much of their efforts retrieving, filtering, and cleaning data and doing initial exploratory data analysis. These responsibilities increasingly demand working with different data technologies and having general programming skills. The potential for interesting and rich interactions for a statistician is greatly increased if he or she has a good knowledge of information technologies.

Other exposure to Markdown Data Science at Smith College Future work and closing thoughts

More from Nolan and Temple Lang

One former student recently wrote to us about exactly that:

I am currently working at a consulting firm that specializes in statistical and economic research and data analysis for large corporations. . . . Every day I work with data, and whether it is running regressions, cleaning data, finding summary statistics, parsing documents, or working in different database environments, [this statistical computing class] gave me the tools and foundation to succeed in my current position and gave me the confidence to land the job in the first place.

• □ ▶ • • □ ▶ • • □ ▶ •

Other exposure to Markdown Data Science at Smith College Future work and closing thoughts

Summary

- reproducible statistical analyses are a (very) good thing
- ability to rerun analyses with different datasets or analytic decisions is a big win
- helps to model appropriate analytic workflow for new users
- reproducibility is emphasized throughout the semester
- requires some startup time to introduce students to this environment
- hurdles can be overcome, and the benefits are well worth it
- critical for students to develop the capacity to "compute with data"
- need for additional faculty development...

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト

Other exposure to Markdown Data Science at Smith College Future work and closing thoughts

Activity

- download the file markdown.Rmd from www.amherst.edu/~nhorton/stolaf
- upload this to the RStudio server at rstudio.stolaf.edu
- run it and work through the questions listed there
- come up with your own questions and tell an interesting story

Other exposure to Markdown Data Science at Smith College Future work and closing thoughts

Precursors to the Data Explosion: Teaching How to Compute with Data

Nicholas J. Horton

Amherst College, Amherst, MA, USA

October 7, 2013

nhorton@amherst.edu

・ 同 ト ・ ヨ ト ・ ヨ